

4th Grade Mini-Research Inquiry Task

California Indians and the Mission System

Written by Lisa A. Hutton, The History Project at CSU Dominguez Hills



Source: The Mission San Diego, Southern California USA, c1915. Photograph courtesy of the Library of Congress, Photographs and Prints Division. <http://hdl.loc.gov/loc.pnp/stereo.1s01712>

Task Overview

This task is part of a larger unit on the Spanish colonization of California and the mission system. This historical investigation is structured as a performance task to provide teachers an opportunity to teach the skills and habits of mind necessary to complete a performance task “on demand” at the end of the year.

Task 1: Students will conduct a short inquiry-based research project, which will ask them to read several short sources about the experiences of the California Indians on the mission. Students will grapple with whether life on the missions was positive or negative for the Indians. They will take notes about the positive and negative aspects of each source. After taking notes about the sources, students will respond to three research questions about the sources.

Task 2: Students will compose a full-length argumentative (opinion) essay, referring to their notes as needed.

Standard Alignment

Common Core State Standards

Reading Standards for Informational Text

RI.4.1 Refer to details and examples in a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when and when drawing inferences from the text.

RI.4.2: Determine the main idea of a text and explain how it is supported by key details; summarize the text.

RI.4.9: Integrate information from two texts on the same topic in order to write or speak about the subject knowledgeably.

RI.4.10: By the end of year, read and comprehend informational texts, including history/social studies, science, and technical texts, in the grades 4–5 text complexity band proficiently, with scaffolding as needed at the high end of the range.

Writing

W.4.7 Conduct short research projects that build knowledge through investigation of different aspects of a topic.

W.4.8. Recall relevant information from experiences or gather relevant information from print and digital sources; take notes, paraphrase, and categorize information, and provide a list of sources.

California History-Social Science Content Standards

4.2 Students describe the major social, political, cultural and economic life and interactions among the people of California from the pre-Columbian societies to the Spanish mission and Mexican rancho periods in terms of:

1. Describe the Spanish exploration and colonization of California, including the relationships among soldiers, missionaries, and Indians (e.g., Juan Crespi, Junipero Serra, Gaspar de Portola).
2. Describe the mapping of, geographic basis of, and economic factors in the placement and function of the Spanish missions; and understand how the mission system expanded the influence of Spain and Catholicism throughout New Spain and Latin America.
3. Describe the daily lives of the people, native and nonnative, who occupied the presidios, missions, ranchos, and pueblos.

Discuss the role of the Franciscans in changing the economy of California from a hunter-gatherer economy to an agricultural economy.

California History-Social Science Analysis Skills

Research, Evidence, and Point of View

1. Students differentiate between primary and secondary sources.
2. Students pose relevant questions about events they encounter in historical documents, eyewitness accounts, oral histories, letters, diaries, artifacts, photographs, maps, artworks, and architecture.

Historical Interpretation

- Students summarize the key events of the era they are studying and explain the historical contexts of those events.
- Students identify the human and physical characteristics of the places they are studying and explain how those features form the unique character
- Students identify and interpret the multiple causes and effects of historical events.
- Students conduct cost-benefit analyses of historical and current events.

Instructional Tasks

Task 1

Materials:

- Student Handouts with sources and graphic organizers

Directions/Input:

- Tell the students that they will be working like historians with primary and secondary sources to answer the following question: *Based on the provided sources, was life on the missions more positive or negative for the California Indians?*
- Students read the sources and notate positive and negative aspects of life on the mission. Teacher scaffolding might include:
 - Primary source analysis
 - Guided “close reading” of sources including think aloud and/or text dependent questions which direct students back into the text
 - Vocabulary work
 - Annotating the text
 - Taking notes
 - Collaborative conversations (whole group, small groups, or pairs) to discuss the sources in relation to the question.

Task 2

Materials:

- Student Handouts with sources and graphic organizers
- Optional: Getting Ready to Write: Evidence and Analysis Graphic Organizer

Directions/Input:

They will then write an essay using the information from the sources. All of the student handouts are below. Depending on the students’ experience completing an inquiry task and full essay, additional whole group modeling, scaffolding, and mini-lessons may be provided. Lessons may include:

Working with evidence

- Evaluating evidence
- Categorizing or sorting evidence into categories
- Working with evidence: quotations versus paraphrasing
- Working with evidence: Analysis, what does analysis mean?

Writing

- Writing a thesis
- Writing an introduction with background, thesis, and main points of essay
- Organizing main points of an essay (the hardest part may be for students to look at all of the evidence and then sort or categorize the evidence into main points for the essay.
- Writing a conclusion
- Citing sources

Student Handout (Page 1)

Source Analysis

Overview: Based on the provided sources, was life on the missions more positive or negative for the California Indians?

Task 1: You will now examine three short sources. Take notes on the sources using the provided graphic organizer.

Source 1: California History

“In San Diego, Serra and his followers built a mission...missionaries offered gifts to people [Native Americans] for coming to learn about Christianity. However, those who came to the mission were not allowed to leave—they became slaves.”

“Many missions grew quite wealthy, thanks to the hard work of Native Americans. They farmed the land, made wine, and tended cattle. All of the missions had buildings for shops for blacksmithing, tanning, candle making, basket weaving, leather working, and furniture making. The missions played a large part in turning native peoples from a hunter-gatherer society toward an agriculture one. On large areas of land they grew grains and fruits, including palms, olives, grapes, figs, oranges, and pomegranates. They had also large herds of cattle and horses and huge flocks of sheep.”

Source: Ansary, Mir Tamim. *California History*. Chicago: Heineman, 2003.

Positive Aspects of Life on Missions

Negative Aspects of Life on the Missions

Student Handout (Page 2)
Source Analysis (continued)

Overview: Based on the provided sources, was life on the missions more positive or negative for the California Indians?

Source 2: Father Junipero Serra

“The Christianized natives pray twice daily with the priest in the church. More than 120 of them confess and many who have died used to do it as well. The others confess as best they can. They work at all kinds of mission labor, such as farm hands, herdsmen, cowboys, shepherds, milkers, diggers, gardeners, carpenters, farmers, irrigators, reapers, blacksmiths, and they everything else that comes along for their physical and spiritual welfare.”

Source: Beebe, Rose Marie & Robert M. Senkewicz. *Junipero Serra: California, Indians, and the Transformation of a Missionary*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2015. 402. Excerpt is from Father Junipero Serra and Father Mathias Antonio Noriega in “Report on the Missions” from Monterey, California on July 1, 1784.

Positive Aspects of Life on Missions

Negative Aspects of Life on the Missions

Source 3: Padre Horra

“The treatment shown to the Indians is the most cruel I have ever read in history. For the slightest things, they receive heavy flogging, are shackled, and put in stocks, and treated with so much cruelty that they are kept whole days without water.”

Source: Bancroft, Hubert Howe, *History of California 1542-1800*. San Francisco: A.L. Bancroft and Company, 1884. Excerpt is from 1799 when Padre Antonio de la Concepcion Horra of Mission San Miguel reported to the New Spain viceroy (page 593).

Positive Aspects of Life on Missions

Negative Aspects of Life on the Missions

Student Handout (Page 3)

Research Questions and Writing Assignment

A. Research Questions: Answer the questions below in order to prepare to write your essay. You may refer to your notes.

1. What are some of the skills or jobs that the Native Americans learned on the missions?

2. Who profited from the wealth created on the missions?

3. What would happen if a Native American wanted to leave the mission?

B. Writing: You will review your notes and sources, plan, draft, and revise your essay, You may use your notes and refer to the sources. You may also refer to the answers you wrote to the research questions

Your Assignment: You have been asked to an argumentative (opinion) essay about the treatment of the California Indians, answering the following question: *Based on the provided sources, was life on the missions more positive or negative for the California Indians?* You may use the graphic organizer to help you plan your essay, then write your essay on lined paper using the same format.

Student Handout (Page 4)

Writing an Argument

Introduction paragraph:

<p>Background Information: _____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>Thesis:</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p>

Body Paragraph #1:

<p>Main Point #1 _____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>Evidence (Supporting Detail from the sources with document citation):</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>Analysis (Explain what your evidence means and how it supports your main point/argument):</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p>

Student Handout (Page 5)

Writing an Argument (continued)

Body Paragraph #2:

Main Point #2 _____

Evidence (Supporting Detail from the sources with document citation):

Analysis (Explain what your evidence means and how it supports your main point/argument):

Body Paragraph #3:

Main Point #3 _____

Evidence (Supporting Detail from the sources with document citation):

Analysis (Explain what your evidence means and how it supports your main point/argument):

Concluding Paragraph:

Restate Thesis:

Concluding Statement:

Student Handout (Page 6)

Scaffold/Mini Lesson Ideas: Sorting Evidence

Positive Aspects of Life on the Missions		
Negative Aspects of Life on the Missions		
Source 1	“In San Diego, Serra and his followers built a mission...missionaries offered gifts to people [Native Americans] for coming to learn about Christianity.”	
Source 1	“However, those who came to the mission were not allowed to leave—they became slaves.”	
Source 1	“Many missions grew quite wealthy, thanks to the hard work of Native Americans.”	
Source 1	“Many missions grew quite wealthy, thanks to the hard work of Native Americans. They farmed the land, made wine, and tended cattle. All of the missions had buildings for shops for blacksmithing, tanning, candle making, basket weaving, leather working, and furniture making.”	
Source 1	“The missions played a large part in turning native peoples from a hunter-gatherer society toward an agriculture one.”	
Source 1	“On large areas of land they grew grains and fruits, including palms, olives, grapes, figs, oranges, and pomegranates. They had also large herds of cattle and horses and huge flocks of sheep.”	
Source 2	“The Christianized natives pray twice daily with the priest in the church. More than 120 of them confess and many who have died used to do it as well. The others confess as best they can.”	
Source 2	“They work at all kinds of mission labor, such as farm hands, herdsmen, cowboys, shepherds, milkers, diggers, gardeners, carpenters, farmers, irrigators, reapers, blacksmiths, and they everything else that comes along for their physical and spiritual welfare.”	
Source 3	“The treatment shown to the Indians is the most cruel I have ever read in history. For the slightest things, they receive heavy flogging, are shackled, and put in stocks, and treated with so much cruelty that they are kept whole days without water.”	

Student Handout (Page 7)

Scaffold/Mini Lesson Ideas: Getting Ready to Write: Evidence & Analysis

Document:

Evidence From the Sources

Write one quote from the document that helps you answer the question, “*Was life on the missions more positive or negative for the California Indians?*” Include the quotation marks.

Now put the quotation in your own words. You may use a sentence starter such as:

According to...

The document states...

Analysis

What does this information mean? Why is it important and how does it relate to the question?

Student Handout (Page 8)

Scaffold/Mini Lesson Ideas: Providing the Evidence Categories

Thesis: The treatment of the Indians on the missions was more negative than positive.		
Loss of freedom and way of life	They are mistreated	They do all the work

Scaffold: Providing the Evidence Categories

Thesis: The treatment of the Indians on the missions was more positive than negative.	
They learned many jobs	They learn about God.

Sample Answers

Source Analysis (4th Grade Classroom Lynwood USD)

Source 1: California History	
<p>“In San Diego, Serra and his followers built a mission... and huge flocks of sheep.” (Source: Ansary, Mir Tamim. <i>California History</i>. Chicago: Heineman, 2003.)</p>	
<p>Positive Aspects of Life on Missions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> I think it is positive because they are learning new jobs (James) They learned new skills (Victoria) They learned how to farm the land, make wine, and tend the cattle. They survived (Marcos) They learned new things to do like tanning, basket weaving, blacksmithing, and candle making (Brianna). 	<p>Negative Aspects of Life on the Missions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> I think it is negative because the Spanish trapped them (James) Changed Native American’s religion. Became slaves (Victoria) Not allowed to leave (Marcos) One negative thing was that they became slaves (Brianna) The Native Americans that went to the mission can not leave (Mallely) They did all the hard work for the padres and the padres got wealthy and the natives kept working. The natives were bossed (Taer)

Source 2: Father Junipero Serra	
<p>“The Christianized natives pray twice daily ... and spiritual welfare.” (Monterey California, July 1, 1784. Father Junipero Serra and Father Mathias Antonio Noriega, “Report on the Missions”)</p>	
<p>Positive Aspects of Life on Missions</p> <p>They learned new skills. They confessed, They learned to speak Spanish and pray in Spanish (Taer)</p> <p>It is positive because they learned about god and they prayed twice (Precious)</p> <p>The Native Americans learned to pray. (Mallely)</p>	<p>Negative Aspects of Life on the Missions</p> <p>Native Americans had to work but they never get credit or freedom (Mallely)</p> <p>They worked and worked. Some died. (Taer)</p> <p>The Native Americans were doing all the work (Precious)</p> <p>They were forced to be a Christian and pray to change their religion and they were forced to learn Spanish (Briana)</p> <p>I think it was a bad thing to do because all the Spanish did was change the Native American’s gods and made them do labor (Luis)</p>

Source 3: Padre Horra	
<p>“The treatment ...without water.” (1799, Padre Antonio de la Concepcion Horra of Mission San Miguel reporting to the New Spain viceroy.)</p>	
<p>Positive Aspects of Life on Missions</p> <p>The father told the truth (Marco)</p> <p>Father said, “It was cruel.” (Victoria)</p> <p>Padre Horra spoke the truth (Mallely)</p> <p>The padre spoke up and said they are mistreating them, (Taer)</p>	<p>Negative Aspects of Life on the Missions</p> <p>They were shackled, put in stocks, and received flogging for the slightest thing. They didn’t get much water (Marco),</p> <p>Some of the Native Americans did not get water if they did something bad (Precious)</p> <p>They were hitting and whipping them and put them shackled also stocks. (Luis F.)</p> <p>A negative thing is that if the Native Americans were hit if they messed up a little.</p>

Sample Answers

Getting Ready to Write: Evidence & Analysis (With Sample Negative Information)

Document: Source 2 Junipero Serra

Evidence From the Sources

Write one quote from the document that helps you answer the question, “Was life on the missions more positive or negative for the California Indians?” Include the quotation marks.

“However, those who came to the mission were not allowed to leave—they became slaves.”

Now put the quotation in your own words. You may use a sentence starter such as:

According to...

The document states...

According to the book, “California History,” the Indians who came to the mission were not allowed to leave and became slaves.

Analysis

What does this information mean? Why is it important and how does it help answer the question?

The Indians did not have their freedom and they couldn’t leave the mission. This is a very negative thing about the missions.